Merton Chapel in the Nineteenth Century

By MARK EVERITT

TOWARDS the end of his study of the Oxford Movement, Dean Church cites the judgment of Warden Brodrick of Merton College on the secession of Newman in 1845. Brodrick, a liberal in politics and in religion, wrote, in his *History of the University of Oxford*,

The first panic was succeeded by a reaction: some devoted adherents followed Mr. Newman to Rome; others relapsed into lifeless conformity; and the University soon resumed its wonted tranquillity.

But in fact, if Warden Brodrick had considered more closely the history of his own college chapel, he might have seen how far from lifeless was the later story of Tractarianism in Oxford. From 1833 to the end of the century, Merton chapel provides an excellent instance of the fortunes of the Oxford Movement.

Before the upheaval of the Oxford Movement, Merton chapel was a quiet and sober place. Its appearance has been preserved for us in the Ackermann print of 1814, which shows the chapel furnished with the classical woodwork designed by Wren and given by a seventeenth-century fellow. Little in the conduct of the services can have changed since the seventeenth century, either. No organ had been heard since before the Civil War. A bequest had been received in 1765, intended to found a choir and set up an organ, but the fellows had successfully deflected it towards the rebuilding of the Hall, so not a note of music can have been heard.

Since the foundation of the College, the chapel had also served as the parish church of the tiny parish of St. John's, but there was no incumbent as such: the minimal duties of the parish had long been carried out by one of the clerical fellows or by the chaplains. A second pulpit and a few seats were provided in the antechapel just outside the screen, and every Wednesday and Friday morning a bell was rung, ' the door of the Chapel being solemnly opened and shut for a congregation that never came '.¹ The building was cold and meanly lighted.²

The Senior and Junior Chaplains were not fellows, and seem to have formed a little corporation of their own, somewhat like priest vicars in cathedrals. They had the right to the fees for marriages and funerals, and the 'piece of cloth', if there was one. They were not over-worked. Two of the fellows were also appointed chaplains annually ('Chapel's Chaplain ' and 'Hampsterley's Chaplain '), and no doubt shared the work. But at \pounds 6 per annum, the Senior and Junior Chaplains were hardly over-paid, and in practice they usually combined the duties with a singing chaplaincy at New College, Magdalen, or Christ Church.

¹ Obituary notice of Warden Bullock Marsham: The Times; Wednesday 29th December 1880.

² The College minutes mention ' means to be taken for warming the chapel ' in 1823; the first of many such entries during the century. Two years later, just before Christmas, we hear that wax candles are to be supplied to the chapel in future.

If one can forgive the chaplains their pluralism,³ it is more difficult to excuse the state of affairs, still common enough at the time, in which Peter Vaughan, the last clerical Warden of Merton, could combine the headship of the College with the Deanery of Chester and two other livings.⁴ A faint air of eighteenth-century corruption, in fact, hangs about the early nineteenth-century clerical fellows. As late as 1857, one of the senior clerical fellows (non-practising, so far as we know) had to be rusticated for persistent drunkenness. Warden Vaughan did at least officiate at the burial of the senior fellow in 1815, and in the following year he buried a postmaster who died in college, and married his sister to the Principal of Jesus College.

All this was soon to change. In 1833 John Keble preached the Assize Sermon on 'National Apostasy' which Newman ever after considered as the start of the Oxford Movement. Oriel College especially, and Trinity, were its centres. But Merton was also well placed to extend the influence of tractarian views, being patron of two of the city churches, and of the little village (as it then was) of Wolvercote, outside.

In the same year in which Keble preached the Assize Sermon, Henry Manning (later Cardinal), and Walter Ker Hamilton (the first Tractarian to become a diocesan bishop in England) were elected fellows. They were followed in 1834 by James Hope (later Hope-Scott), who was aged no more than 201 at the time. Manning only stayed a year, and Hamilton had become Vicar of St. Peter's-in-the-East when he came under tractarian influence. But Hope was soon one of the leaders. He was a lawyer by training, and a layman, which is perhaps why his name is less familiar than those of Newman, Keble, or Pusey. But after he had become a friend of Newman in 1837, he was soon one of the chief legal advisers to the Tractarians, and a man who enjoyed their complete confidence. 'Ask Hope' was a proverb among them, in cases of doubt or difficulty. Hope played a leading part in attempting to persuade Merton College to reform itself in the spirit of its original statutes. He was a member of the committee set up in 1837, which produced a report in the following year proposing that all the fellows (with the exception of five in the learned professions of Law and Medicine) should study theology and proceed to the B.D. They were to read essays in the college hall on the theological subjects they had studied. What is more, the report was accepted, and the fellows attempted to live up to it, for a short while. Hope also persuaded the College to repair the Founder's monument in Rochester cathedral.

These were the golden years of Newman's ascendancy in Oxford, what has been called the 'poetic phase of Tractarianism'. For the Oxford Movement traces its origin to Keble's book of verse The Christian Year at least as much as to the Tracts for the Times. Other young fellows came under the spell. Most attractive among them is William Adams, who was tutor from 1837-41, and then Vicar of St. Peter's, until an accident ruined his health and he had to retire to die in the Isle of Wight. His influence was great as a tutor, but greater and more widespread as

³ The monument to Charles Wheeler (chaplain from 1824 to 1835) in the south transept announces that he also held the perpetual curacy of Stratton Audley, near Bicester. Who did his duty there? *J. R. L. Highfield, 'Two Accounts of the Death of Dr. Peter Vaughan', Oxoniensia, XXXX (1974), 92-5.

the author of two charming and poetical prose allegories, *The Shadow of the Cross* and *The Distant Hills*.

With hindsight, it seems evident enough that Hope's attempt to bring the fellows back to the spirit of the statutes was bound to fail. It did not seem so at the time. But the fellows' enthusiasm for the project was short-lived. In 1845, a committee had to be set up to enquire how far the new rules (or old rules) had been carried out. In its report it expressed anxiety about the insufficient number of clerical fellows, and suggested that the number of lay fellows be reduced to six so that the clerical fellows could rise to twelve and the services of the chapel be adequately looked after. It was Hope's swan-song in Merton. Two years later he married, and vacated his fellowship.

Five years earlier, the second notable name of the early tractarian period had appeared on the books. John Hungerford Pollen (elected in 1842) had been a convinced Tractarian since his undergraduate days at Christ Church. He arrived at exactly the right moment. The restoration of the chapel had just been mooted. Pollen was a man of considerable artistic gifts and great energy, who was to have a lasting influence on the process by which Merton chapel was turned from a decent classical shrine inside a gothic shell into something like the chapel as we see it today, restored and refurnished in a 'properly Christian' style by William Butterfield. Hope gave five years' stipend as fellow to the project. Pollen did more, and carried out some of the work himself. In 1850 he gained the College's permission to paint the ceiling of the choir, and he included in his scheme of decoration portraits of several of his contemporaries. Dr. Pusey appears as Jeremiah, ' the Prophet of the Captivity'; and Manning (not yet a Roman Catholic) as 'Daniel, the Prophet of Doctrine'; while St. Gregory the Great is an excellent portrait of the Warden, Bullock Marsham. Years later, in 1877, when he had long ceased to be a fellow, he was allowed to extend his scheme of decoration to the upper part of the walls. Time has not dealt kindly with his work. The ceiling remains, but the paintings on the walls faded and peeled, and were finally expunged in 1968-9. But Pollen's work made an important contribution to the appearance of the chapel, as we can still see it in mid-Victorian prints and drawings.

Hungerford Pollen was an energetic man. During nearly the whole of his Oxford residence he was Dean, Garden Master and Bursar, as well as painting the chapel roof and acting as Proctor when the College's turn came round. The one sphere where the College seems to have been reluctant to allow him much scope was in the chapel services. He took his ordination very seriously, in the tractarian manner. In preparation for entering on the diaconate he 'engaged for lessons in plainchant . . . in view of future Gregorian services'. (The revival of plainchant, as the only authentic form of catholic church music, was one of the minor planks in the platform of the Oxford Movement). He was a firm believer in the necessity of private confession, and went to Pusey for this purpose. But apart from his initial curacy at St. Peter-le-Bailey, he never held any official cure in the Church of England. No doubt he was considered too extreme in his views. But having no cure, he often took duty in the chapels of the houses of Sisters of Mercy, such as the one which Hamilton and Pusey's wife had established in Holywell Manor, the remains of whose chapel can still be seen in the garden there. He went to assist

at St. Saviour's, Leeds, throughout the cholera epidemic in the winter of 1847–8. St. Saviour's had been founded by Pusey: it was one of the very first ritualistic churches (though mild enough by the standards of what was to come later), and it had frequent difficulties with the Bishop of Ripon, who referred to it as ' that plague spot of my diocese'. Pollen was later forbidden to officiate in All Saints, Margaret Street, in London, and to hear confessions in the diocese of Oxford. No wonder Merton shrank from letting him loose in the chapel.⁵ But he did his best, even here. His Diary records:

Merton. Monday before Easter 1848—Tried what could be done to swing our bells by means of pulleys in the galleries . . .

Easter Day, 12.45 night. Precisely as the clock struck midnight, I had the bells rung for half an hour.

Pollen found sympathisers with the Oxford Movement in Merton, and in 1849 the College decreed that two sermons should be preached in each term on the subject of Communion. But Pollen himself was not destined to remain in the Church of England. In 1851 the Judicial Committee of the Privy Council delivered the celebrated 'Gorham Judgment', as a consequence of which more Tractarians were shaken in their allegiance to the Church of England. James Hope and Manning went over to Rome, and Hamilton was in two minds whether to follow them, but, as Manning's biographer acidly comments, was prevailed upon to become Bishop of Salisbury instead. Oxford too was stirred by the affair, and in the following year Pollen, flamboyant as ever, was received in France by the Archbishop of Rouen, and communicated to the fellows of Merton that he had been received into the Catholic Church, 'meaning thereby (comments the writer of the College minutes) the Roman Catholic Church'.

But most of the Tractarians were not to be shaken. Keble reacted with his famous remark, 'If the Church of England were to fail, it should be found in my parish'. And in Oxford, too, there were men who were determined to put sound tractarian principles into practice in their parishes. One of them, George Noel Freeling (of whom more later), was admitted a fellow of Merton in the year that Pollen left, and soon went to act as curate to his uncle in a little country parish near Salisbury.

An opportunity for putting tractarian principles into practice arose unexpectedly on the doorstep of the College itself, in the shape of the little parish of St. John's, of which the College chapel was still, as we have seen, technically the parish church. An early act of Samuel Wilberforce, the reforming bishop of Oxford, had been to raise the question of the spiritual charge of St. John's parish. The College was persuaded to present one of the clerical fellows to the living, and assigned him £30 per annum as his stipend. First one, then two Sunday services were instituted. One of the junior fellows, Harry Walter Sargent, became the second vicar in 1854, saw his opportunity, and took it with both hands. He set out at once to ' make the services what they ought to be'. How Sargent was converted to tractarian views we do not know. He was a relation of the evangelical vicar of Lavington, John

⁵ He was, however, Hampsterley's Chaplain in 1846 and Chapel's Chaplain in 1847.

25I

Sargent, two of whose daughters married Manning and Samuel Wilberforce respectively. He was an undergraduate at Merton in the days of Hope and Pollen, and was elected to a fellowship in 1848 at the age of 23. A volume of his sermons survives,⁶ and it reveals a serious, catholic, and sacramental view of Christianity, in the best tradition of tractarian preaching. Sargent was also a musician, with a love of church music, and plainchant in particular. The parish services in Merton chapel were to become his life's work. The story is told in the Introduction to his sermons. written by his former curate at St. John's, P. G. Medd, then a fellow of University College.

'When Harry Sargent entered on his incumbency in 1854, the Chapel had not long been restored and decorated under the able and appreciative care of Mr. Butterfield, and the stately proportions of its sanctuary, and of the cross transept which practically served as its nave, seemed to call for a worship worthy of a building, which for solemnity of devotional effect is perhaps unequalled by any of its size . . . All indeed who knew Sargent loved and honoured him, whether quite agreeing with his Church ways or not. Still, unwonted energy and care in things religious is never, at any rate at first, universally acceptable, and so there were those in whose ears the sound even of Merton's silvery bells at unaccustomed and more frequent hours was not altogether grateful.

What did he get up to? He trained a choir of a dozen or so little boys in his rooms, and gained the College's permission to use the choir of the chapel. The complete round of the Praver Book services-Mattins, Holy Communion and Evensongwere sung on Sundays and Saints' days, and a large and appreciative congregation soon gathered. How the fellows, many of them, disliked what was going on! They withdrew their permission to use the chapel proper, except for Communion, where they had no choice. The bishop remonstrated, but they wrote to him that

... the College is impressed with the conviction that the mode in which the services have been conducted of late is foreign to the meaning of its original proposal, and is at variance both with the real wants of the parishioners, and with its own interests as a place of education.

The bishop replied that he could not conceive what the objection could be, and that when he had been present 'there has been nothing peculiar in the conduct of the service. It has been a singularly well-conducted choral service and no more'. But the ban on the use of the choir remained. Still Sargent was not to be put off:

The choir-boys and men, now about twenty-four in number, were removed to a chorus cantorum constructed under the tower, immediately eastward of the west window. The vestry was transferred from the south transept to the space between the font and the door in the north transept: the whole of the south transept was covered with floorcloth7 and provided with chairs; and in lieu of the harmonium, a very fine organ by Hill occupied the space between the font and the choir-stalls . . . No frequenter of Merton Chapel in its palmy days will ever forget the expressive beauty of their varying accompaniments to the grand old tones, which were themselves sung in unison. The recollection of the Ambrosian Te Deum, of Marbeck's Creed, of the perfectly sung metrical hymns, and of the musical portions of the Communion Service . . . must be cherished by most of those who regularly frequented the church in the years from 1860 to 1867. In anthems, happily, we indulged but seldom.

⁶ Merton Sundays (Oxford, 1876. Printed by private subscription). ⁷ 'Kamptulicon' matting (College minutes).

The services were, in fact, of a congregational, not cathedral type, and were held to realise 'very nearly the highest type of parish worship '. The fellows were wrong in thinking that all this was unsuited to a place of education. Sensitive undergraduates like Mandell Creighton (later to become Bishop of London) acknowledged their debt to Sargent's services. The celebrations of Holy Communion on Sundays and Saints' days, in particular, met a real need. Celebrations were still rare in college chapels in the 1860s (Merton increased the number to four a term in 1864), and choral celebrations were rare, even in cathedrals. It was remarkable, too, to take part in celebrations where more men were present than women, ' and to see uplifted for the Sacred Elements palms that bore evident traces of familiarity with the cricket-bat and the oar '. So Sargent's services remained popular, and they were given diocesan recognition. It was in Merton chapel that the diocesan Choirs' Festival held its first annual meeting in 1861, when ' the chancel was filled with a surpliced choir nearly 300 strong '. And it was here that the daily services were held when Wilberforce launched his first Church Congress in 1862.

Sargent compiled a Merton hymn-book, canticles, and an improved Gregorian psalter.8 His aim was to set an example of ' what an English Church Service might be made in respect of dignity and beauty, and that without any approach to overminuteness of ceremonial' (Obituary in the Guardian). He was exhibiting the Prayer Book services in their complete integrity at exactly the same time as the fellows were proposing the shortening of the college services, in the teeth of an appeal against the move by three fellows to the Visitor. Most unfortunately, just as his services were at the height of their popularity and influence, Sargent ruptured a blood vessel and had to leave Oxford for the south coast. The services went on in his absence, but when he died, three years later, the same number of the Guardian which contained a glowing obituary of him carried also an announcement saying ' In consequence of the lamented death of the Rev. H. W. Sargent . . . the services of the choir will be discontinued after Sunday next'. The College lost no time, either, in having the organ taken away (it had been installed at Sargent's personal expense), and, a postmaster of the time records, ' when I went up in 1869 not a note of music was ever heard in the Chapel; the lighting was confined to about two dozen ordinary candles and everything was run through in most perfunctory style '.

Sargent's was the only attempt to make something out of the parish of St. John Baptist. After his death, the parish services sank back into a more routine mould, and they were never again a force in Oxford. And at the time of Sargent's death, with university reform once again in the air, the old establishment of non-fellow chaplains was at last abolished. The last of them was appointed to the parish living, where, presumably, having learned to do what he was told in the college services, he could be trusted not to make himself a nuisance. But from 1869 onwards, the senior chaplain was always a fellow.

⁸ No copy of any of these publications, nor of *Merton Sundays*, was preserved in the College. The proof copy of the *Merton Tune Book* was presented to the College by a descendant of Sargent some twenty-five years ago. The Psalter and Canticles were printed by W. R. Bowden, of Holywell Street, Oxford, in ordinary staff notation. Sargent's system in the Psalter is clear, deliberately similar in appearance to Anglican pointing, and sensitively applied. The whole appearance of the book is legible and beautiful.

The 1870s saw the college services taken in hand at last. Freeling returned from his country parish to be chaplain in 1869, and he was also Vicar of Holywell from 1871. He wrung from the College permission for a musical service in chapel 'if the expenses be provided by private subscription, and . . . it be regulated by the Warden, and Messrs. Freeling and Creighton'. He established a weekly celebration of Holy Communion and persuaded the College to set up an organ and pay for an organist. He also trained an undergraduate choir (who wore surplices) and was himself, it was said, 'in voice production a good half of it'. These were the last days when clerical fellows made up a substantial proportion of the Governing Body, though the requirement for a fixed proportion of ordained fellows had been repealed in 1870.

Mandell Creighton (afterwards Bishop of London: his icon-like portrait in enamels hangs in the S.W. corner of the hall) was ordained in 1870–1 and preached regularly thereafter. He was one of the new breed of married fellows, and on Sundays he and his wife walked from their house a mile away in St. Giles to attend the three services in chapel. R. J. Wilson (later to become the second Warden of Keble) was an influential High-Churchman, and E. A. Knox (later Bishop of Manchester and father of Ronnie Knox) came in 1869 as the first and last convinced Evangelical in what was becoming a college with a quiet but definite tractarian ethos. So Merton chapel began to flourish again.

These were the years of the growth of the ritualist movement, and of the attempt to curb it by various means, culminating in Disraeli's Public Worship Regulation Act of 1875, the 'Bill to put down Popery'. Popery took differing forms, but among the hotly contested points of ritual were the use of lighted candles and the use of the 'eastward position' in the Communion service. A former fellow of Merton had written a learned pamphlet defending the eastward position, and the question was raised at College meetings. A year later, the minutes note that 'Fellows are not to introduce changes in the mode of conducting services, and that the former custom of the College as to Holy Communion be reverted to '. Who had made what changes? We can only guess, but clearly there lies behind this resolution some long-standing disagreement between Freeling and Wilson, of the High Church party, and the Evangelical, Knox.

Knox took over the living of St. John's in 1874. He ran the parish services, a class for the choir boys at 3, and a short service for College servants each Sunday night at 8 during term. The Sunday evening services, at least, were popular. An outside impression of the parish services at this time comes from the Herefordshire diarist, Kilvert, who visited Oxford in 1876:

Holy Thursday, 25 May Ascension Day. Mayhew and I made a rush for Magdalen Chapel this morning but were too late... We loitered through the Botanical Gardens and up the Broad Walk. At length while wandering about Merton we heard the roll of the organ and went in to the Ante Chapel. Service was going on in the Chapel and the first words that struck upon our ears were the opening sentences of that fearful Athanasian Creed.

When service was over, and the 'very small congregation' had left, they came across Knox and his choirboys on the terrace, beating the bounds.

What of the College services? The fellows continued to legislate for them in minute detail. It happens that we have a very full account of the Sunday services in 1884–5 in the manuscript diaries of an undergraduate of the time named Fillingham, who took a rather obsessive interest in church matters and recorded the details of every service he attended, and often a digest of the sermons he heard as well. On his first Sunday (12 October 1884) he observes:

It is the rule to keep two chapels at Merton on Sundays:⁹ the evening service was at five. It was the heartiest service I had yet seen at Merton Chapel: it was fully choral. Mr Freeling intoned it and the men sang very vigorously. (I did not see anyone cross himself, but one bowed a good deal.) The chapel looked pretty lighted up with candles, which are fixed on the stalls, and the two altar lights gleamed in the dimness of the chancel.

He notes that Hymns A & M (new edition) is in use, and always tells us the numbers of the two hymns sung. On the following Sunday he observed Knox celebrate at the north end 'in a very Low Church fashion ', and the Sunday after that, when he entered for Morning Prayer, 'Mr. Freeling had been celebrating in the eastward position with lighted candles, so there is a great diversity of uses at Merton chapel '. Fillingham thought little of Freeling's sermons, and was not much impressed by the musical standard of the services, which were still sung to plainchant, as they had been in Sargent's day (though now from Helmore's Psalter). 'The singing was very bad today; nobody keeping time at all: the Gregorians seemed very unsuitable ' (Entry for 16 Nov. 1884). Though Fillingham was unaware of the fact, an era was coming to an end. Almost all the clerical fellows had left during the 1870s, to college livings or to headmasterships. Now Knox was to be the last to leave (except for Wilson who by this time was also Vicar of Radley and Warden of the School, and not much, therefore, in Merton). Fillingham describes his going:

Knox preached his farewell sermon at 5 on 'We must all appear before the judgment seat of Christ'. The service closed with a touch of the ridiculous; for, as we were all thinking of Mr Knox's departure, Mr Freeling gave out the hymn 'Now thank we all our God'.

Knox was replaced as Junior Chaplain by J. O. Johnston, the biographer of Liddon. 'Mr. Johnston, formerly of All Souls, read the Litany in a portentous monotone' (Entry for 28 Jan. 1885), but he tended to preach 'in a deafening roar'. He was not a fellow, however. After Wilson became Warden of Keble, Freeling was the last clerical fellow left.

He is a man well worth remembering. He had been a friend of Hamilton, the first tractarian bishop, friend of Manning, and he remained a friend of the later Oxford Tractarians. He was 'the one man who so eminently carried on [in Oxford] the traditions of refinement and uncompromising faith, which marked the early Tractarians '.¹⁰ He made his mark as much in the city and diocese as in the College. Vicar of Holywell and later of St. John's too, as well as Chaplain, he was at different times Rural Dean of Oxford, Secretary to the Diocesan Conference, Proctor in Convocation, and Honorary Canon of Christ Church. He supported all

⁹ By this date, undergraduates were permitted to opt out of weekday chapel and attend a roll-call instead. ¹⁰ Life and Letters of Dean Butler (1897).

manner of good causes; among them, the Holywell Penitentiary, the English Church Union and the Oxford Gregorian Choral Association. But it was inside Merton that his influence was most deeply felt. He lived in College, where he was the senior resident fellow for the latter years of his life. But he was never a tutor, and he had nothing to do with the now well established system of tuition and discipline. This cross-bench position had great pastoral advantages:

... in his office as Chaplain he exercised a sober, purifying, religious influence, making the personal acquaintance of each successive generation of undergraduates, able by the independence of his position, as not being directly connected with the tutorial staff, to become a confidential friend and advisor, and when occasion served, mediator.¹¹

He was not a great preacher: Fillingham wrote of his 'dry and disconnected sermons', and his two published sermons are plain and sincere rather than eloquent. He led a life of strict discipline, and he held strongly to his decided High Church views. But he won and retained the love and confidence of men of all parties 'by simple goodness, by a piety which had not a trace of hypocrisy or vanity, by transparent unselfishness'. 'Simple goodness': the phrase is echoed by Creighton, and by Knox who was very much at the opposite end of the scale in religious views.

So we enter the 1890s, to find the fellows still discussing means of improving the heating and lighting of the chapel. But Merton chapel was withdrawing fast from the city and university scene. The University Sermon which was formerly preached in Merton chapel on 1st May was abolished in 1891. In the same year, the winding up of the little parish of St. John's, which had been discussed many times during the century, was finally achieved, and St. John Baptist was united with St. Peter-in-the-East. Not long after, in early January 1892, Freeling died in his rooms. He had been a fellow for almost forty years, and chaplain for twenty-two of them. When he became a fellow, before the University reforms of the 1850s, more than half the Governing Body were in Holy Orders: when he died, he was the last clerical fellow left. 209 members and former members of the College subscribed to his memorial, and a portrait of him was painted (by Lowes Dickinson) and hung for a time in the College hall. No chaplain before or since has been so honoured.

There was one ironic consequence of his death which he would not have appreciated, and which oddly parallels what happened after the death of Sargent. Two months later, Warden Brodrick reported to the College meeting that he contemplated introducing Anglican chants instead of Gregorians at the Sunday evening chapel services. It was another indication that the last afterglow of the original tractarian movement had faded away.

¹¹ The Remembrance of a Faithful Pastor. 'A sermon preached in St. Cross Church on Sunday January 17, 1892, after the funeral of Canon G. N. Freeling, by William Ince, Regius Professor of Divinity.